The Evolution of Tourism in Afghanistan: A Review of the Last 50 Years
Irfan Ullah Stanikzai*, Wasiq Ullah Hamdard
Lecturer at Economics Faculty Al-Taqwa, Institute of Higher Education
Corresponding Author: Irfan Ullah Stanikzai Irfanullah6066@gmail.com

ARTICLE INFO
Keywords: Evolution, Tourism, Afghanistan, Review

ABSTRACT
The aim of this study is to provide a comprehensive review of the evolution of tourism in Afghanistan over the past 50 years, examining the factors, challenges, and opportunities that have shaped the industry's development and impact on the country's cultural, social, and economic landscapes. This review paper employed a systematic approach, including comprehensive searches using electronic databases and search engines, screening of articles based on inclusion criteria, full-text review, systematic analysis of included articles, and synthesis of key findings, methodologies, reports, news, and best practices to provide a comprehensive overview of the Evolution of Tourism in Afghanistan: A Review of the Last 50 Years. The review reveals the profound impact of the political and security situation, the influence of factors on tourist arrivals such as heritage sites and geopolitical factors, the evolution of marketing strategies and promotion efforts, and the challenges and opportunities faced by Afghanistan's tourism industry, including political instability, security concerns, inadequate infrastructure, limited financing, and negative perceptions, with the potential for sustainable development through strengthened security measures, improved infrastructure, enhanced marketing efforts, and international partnerships. In conclusion, Afghanistan has the potential to develop a thriving and sustainable tourism sector by addressing challenges, capitalizing on unique attractions, and fostering collaboration among stakeholders, leading to economic growth, cultural preservation, and employment opportunities. Strengthen security, preserve heritage, enhance marketing, collaborate with agencies, improve infrastructure, foster partnerships, and involve local communities for Afghan tourism development.
INTRODUCTION

Tourism in Afghanistan has a long history, dating back to ancient times when the region was a crossroads of trade and culture along the Silk Road. The country's rich cultural heritage, including its historical sites, diverse landscapes, and traditional arts, has attracted visitors for centuries. However, the modern tourism industry in Afghanistan began to develop in the mid-20th century, with the construction of hotels, infrastructure, and the promotion of the country's natural and cultural attractions. Despite periods of conflict and instability, efforts to promote tourism have continued, and the industry has seen some growth in recent years.

Modern tourism in Afghanistan began to develop in the mid-20th century, particularly during the 1950s and 1960s. This period saw the construction of hotels, infrastructure, and the promotion of the country's natural and cultural attractions. The Afghan government at the time actively promoted the country as a tourist destination, and efforts were made to attract visitors from other countries. This era marked the beginning of the modern tourism industry in Afghanistan.

The Afghanistan Tourism Organization became a member of the International Tourism Organization in 1975 along with 102 other countries. Along with Iran, Pakistan, Bangladesh, India, Sri Lanka, Maldives and Nepal, Afghanistan also took a step as an active member of the South Asia Commission and provided necessary facilities for the development of the tourism industry in Afghanistan. He provided ground and earned good incomes and made Afghanistan known to the world in terms of civilization, history, culture, ancient and cultural heritage.

In 1971, tourism was an important income source and around 9,0000 to 120,000 tourists visited Afghanistan every year. Rich culture, old history, the memories of silk, beautiful and pleasant natural scenery and mild air and water (climate) are the special tourism values of Afghanistan that are interesting and attractive to tourists.

The period from 1960 to 1970 marked a significant phase in the history of tourism in Afghanistan. The government's efforts to promote cultural heritage, the establishment of the Afghan Tourist Organization, and the emergence of adventure tourism contributed to the growth of the industry. However, challenges related to accessibility and security persisted. Understanding the events and trends of this decade provides valuable insights into the early stages of Afghanistan's tourism development. 1970 to 1980 was marked by significant political changes and external factors that influenced the country's tourism industry. This period witnessed both opportunities and challenges for Afghanistan's tourism sector, the period from 1970 to 1980 was
a challenging time for tourism in Afghanistan due to political instability and conflict. The decline in visitor arrivals and the negative impact on the country's image as a tourist destination were significant setbacks. While efforts were made to promote tourism and highlight Afghanistan's cultural heritage, the conflict and security concerns overwhelmed the industry. The subsequent Soviet-Afghan War in the 1980s further deepened the crisis. Understanding the historical context of this period provides insights into the immense challenges faced by Afghanistan's tourism sector.

The period from 1980 to 1990 witnessed a significant decline in tourism in Afghanistan due to the Soviet-Afghan War. The ongoing conflict, destruction of infrastructure, and restrictive policies severely impacted the industry. The decline in visitor arrivals and the negative perception of Afghanistan as an unsafe destination further hindered tourism development. Understanding the historical context of this period provides insights into the immense challenges faced by Afghanistan's tourism sector.

The period from 1990 to 2000 witnessed a significant decline in tourism in Afghanistan due to continued conflict, political instability, and the oppressive policies of the government. The restrictive cultural practices, combined with the negative perception of the country as an unsafe destination, severely impacted the tourism industry. The Afghan Tourist Organization faced significant challenges in promoting tourism, and the decline in visitor arrivals resulted in economic hardships for local communities. Understanding the historical context of this period provides insights into the immense challenges faced by Afghanistan's tourism sector.

The study makes a valuable contribution to the existing body of knowledge by addressing research gaps and providing new insights. Through thorough research and analysis, it advances understanding in the field and offers practical implications for professionals and decision-makers. The study's empirical evidence, coupled with its literature review and synthesis, provides a comprehensive understanding of the topic and serves as a foundation for future research and development.

**Problem Statement**

There is a need to critically examine the evolution of tourism in Afghanistan during the last five decades and identify the key barriers and opportunities that have shaped its development. By understanding these factors, policymakers, stakeholders, and industry professionals can formulate effective strategies to overcome the challenges and unlock the potential of Afghanistan's tourism sector for the future.

**Research questions**

1. How has the political climate influenced tourism in Afghanistan over the past 50 years?
2. What factors have affected tourist arrivals in Afghanistan during the last five decades?
3. How have marketing strategies contributed to the evolution of Afghanistan's tourism industry in the last 50 years?

Objective

The objective of this topic is to review the evolution of tourism in Afghanistan over the past 50 years. The review aims to provide a comprehensive understanding of the transformation of tourism in Afghanistan and its significance in the context of the nation's history and future prospects. Moreover to understand existing literature, case studies, and best practices from around the world to identify successful sustainable tourism initiatives that can be adapted and implemented in the Afghan context.

LITERATURE REVIEW

Tourism in Conflict

Tourism in Afghanistan experienced its heyday in the 1970s, drawing over 90,000 global visitors who sought to explore the country's unparalleled beauty and experience the genuine hospitality of its people. Despite enduring years of conflict, Kabul, the capital city, remains a captivating blend of old and new, with ongoing redevelopment projects and a growing international presence infusing the city with a touch of modern architecture, fostering hope for a peaceful and prosperous future. Afghanistan's rich history spanning thousands of years encompasses remarkable attractions such as the ancient Buddha Statues, the tomb of Hazrate Ali, the city of Balkh, and the stunning lakes of Band-e Amir, whose azure waters provide a striking contrast against the surrounding mountains. While the country's strategic importance throughout history has left forgotten trails of past armies, the government is actively engaged in rebuilding the war-torn infrastructure and establishing vital transport links and nationwide telecommunications. Furthermore, the government's strong support for private sector investment in the tourism industry, coupled with the industry's untapped potential and global interest, positions Afghanistan to further develop and flourish, with the Ministry of Foreign Affairs ready to offer assistance in advancing the country's tourism sector. ("Tourism in Afghanistan," n.d.)

The Golden Age of Afghan Tourism

During the 1930s and 1940s, the first tourism companies emerged in Afghanistan, offering a range of services including accommodations, transportation, and guided visits to tourist sites. However, it was during the period from the 1950s to the 1970s, characterized by relative political stability, that Afghan tourism experienced its golden age. This era witnessed a significant expansion of tourism infrastructure, with the establishment of luxury hotels,
restaurants, and tourist companies primarily catering to affluent Western travelers. Popular activities during this time included archeological tours and skiing. Notably, Kabul became a destination for football clubs' preparation camps, to the extent that Esteghlal of Iran (Taj) traveled to the city to hold a friendly soccer match with the Afghanistan national team. ("Tourism industry in Afghanistan," 2023).

Unlocking Afghanistan's Tourism Potential

Afghanistan, with its breathtaking snowcapped mountains, ancient religious monuments, scenic beauty, rivers, and diverse climatic conditions, possesses remarkable tourism potential despite its current weak economy. The country has a significant opportunity to utilize the tourism industry as a catalyst for economic development by implementing appropriate policies to attract international tourists. In 2018, international tourists spent $1.3 billion per day globally, highlighting the revenue potential and its contribution to the balance of payments in many countries. Afghanistan, with its rugged mountains covering 85 percent of the land surface and iconic attractions like the Buddha of Bamiyan and Minaret Jam in provinces such as Ghor, Herat, Ghazni, and Balkh, holds immense appeal for international visitors seeking cultural, historical, and religious tourism experiences. These attractions bring about substantial economic and trade opportunities for the country if other factors remain stable. (Ebrahimi, M. A., 2022).

Tourism Potential: Policies, Preservation, and Progress

Afghanistan has significant potential for various types of tourism due to its stark beauty and rich heritage. The Afghanistan National Development Strategy aims to develop a reasonable and realistic policy for tourism, emphasizing the preservation of historical assets such as cities, buildings, monuments, and archaeological sites. The Afghan Tourism Organization played a vital role in promoting tourism in the country, managing guest houses, organizing tours, and employing translators and tour guides. Since 2001, with the re-establishment of the Afghan Tourism Organization, private sector operators have been regulated through registration and supervision. The number of international tourists visiting Afghanistan has been relatively low, with the majority coming from neighboring countries. However, efforts have been made to improve security, upgrade infrastructure, preserve cultural and environmental assets, and promote traditional handicrafts as part of the Draft National Tourist Strategy. The provinces of Bamyan and Badakhshan have been identified as having tourism potential, particularly with the establishment of Band-e-Amir as Afghanistan's first National Park and the development of ecotourism in the area (Public Library, 2024).
Harnessing Tourism for Economic Development in Afghanistan

Tourism plays a significant role in the development of Afghanistan. The study emphasizes the potential of tourism as a tool for economic growth, job creation, and poverty reduction in the country. It highlights the need for appropriate policies and infrastructure development to attract international tourists and maximize the benefits of the tourism industry. The authors argue that tourism can contribute to the diversification of the Afghan economy and enhance the country's image on the global stage (Yar, F.G.M., & Yasouri, M. 2021)

Challenges and Potential for Tourism in Bamiyan Valley, Afghanistan

The Bamiyan Valley in Afghanistan's central highlands, renowned for its natural beauty and historical significance, faces obstacles in developing its tourism industry. The nearby Band-e Amir, a collection of striking blue lakes, further enhances its allure. However, ongoing instability, violence, and inadequate infrastructure impede the growth of tourism in Bamiyan. Nonetheless, Hotel Silk Road Bamiyan caters to foreigners working in Afghanistan, although the revival of tourism in the area remains challenging due to security concerns and the absence of direct international flights. (Blua, A. 2009)

Enhancing Rural Development through Tourism Management in Afghanistan

Rural tourism management in Afghanistan plays a crucial role in the economic and social development of rural areas. It serves as a means to reduce poverty by creating employment opportunities, utilizing resources effectively, and distributing income. Additionally, it fosters entrepreneurship, prevents migration, promotes cultural exchange and community connections, and contributes to the overall welfare and development of rural areas. Despite Afghanistan's favorable geographical location and natural attractions, the study reveals that the management of rural tourism has been hindered by security, political, cultural, economic, and social challenges. Adaptive programs and activities in the industry have been limited, impacting its potential contribution to rural development in Afghanistan. (Habibyar, S. 2020)

Stakeholder Perceptions and Teaching Sustainability in Tourism Development in Bamiyan

According to (Franklin, K. E. 2021) the study combines an examination of stakeholders' perceptions of inclusive and sustainable tourism development in Bamyan, Afghanistan, with an innovative approach to teaching sustainability in a tourism higher education program, addressing the underdeveloped discussions on teaching sustainability in conflict-affected contexts.
Tourism Sector in Afghanistan Generates Income Despite Security Concerns

According to the Ministry of Information and Culture (MoIC), despite a 5% decline in the number of foreign tourists to Afghanistan due to security concerns, the tourism sector has managed to generate an annual income of nearly one billion Afghanis. MoIC spokesman Harun Hakimi highlighted that foreign tourists have access to 12 provinces in the country, which house over 200 historical sites. The ministry issues approximately 100,000 tourism visas for foreign tourists each year. However, Hakimi noted that while the tourism industry generates substantial income, most of it goes to private companies involved in relevant activities. He also mentioned that the number of foreign tourists visiting Afghanistan has experienced a 5% decrease compared to the previous year. Meanwhile, the Agha Khan Foundation officials reported that they have successfully restored over 100 historical sites in Afghanistan, including the renowned Babur Gardens and other reconstructed sites in Herat, as stated by Abdul Azim Saleh, the foundation's CEO. (TOLONews., 2016).

Tourism Potential

Afghanistan, with its rich cultural and historical heritage, has long been recognized as a country with a prominent reputation in the tourism sector. Throughout the country, there are visible signs of ancient civilizations and historic landmarks, attracting tourists from around the world. Investing in the tourism sector has proven to be beneficial for Afghanistan, as it enables the country to generate revenue from tourism expenditures and contribute to its economic development. By strategically developing the tourism industry and showcasing its offerings to the world, Afghanistan could potentially gain significant financial and political advantages. For instance, countries like Switzerland collect billions of dollars from tourism by attracting visitors to their mountains for skiing. Afghanistan's unique geography, featuring fresh climates and breathtaking natural beauties, including snowy mountains ideal for skiing, has the potential to captivate international travelers. However, it is regrettable that security concerns and other issues have hampered Afghanistan's natural beauty and the tourism sector. Insufficient strategic planning and promotion have failed to intensify tourism and project a positive image of Afghanistan to the world. Despite the country's vast potential to attract international tourists, Afghanistan continues to face overwhelming poverty rates, job recessions, and economic challenges. Predictions suggest that after the withdrawal of international forces in 2014, Afghanistan may face an economic crisis. However, revitalizing the tourism industry could serve as a positive alternative, providing job opportunities and improving daily incomes for the people. While security is often cited as a major obstacle, the reality shows that even in provinces with better security situations, there is a lack of tourists and international visitors. This indicates the need for effective programs and strategies to be implemented.
in order to develop the tourism industry in Afghanistan and overcome these challenges. (Bakhtar News Agency., 2014).

**Fluctuating International Tourism Receipts in Afghanistan**

The Afghanistan International Tourism: Receipts data for 2020 was reported at 75.000 USD mn, showing a decrease from the previous year's figure of 85.000 USD mn. The data, which is updated yearly, has an average value of 86.000 USD mn from December 2008 to 2020, based on 13 observations. In 2013, the receipts reached their highest point at 179.000 USD mn, while in 2017, they hit a record low of 16.000 USD mn. This data is actively maintained by CEIC and reported by the World Bank. It is categorized under the Global Database's Afghanistan - Table AF.World Bank.WDI: Tourism Statistics. International tourism receipts encompass expenditures made by international visitors, including payments to national carriers for international transport. These receipts may also include prepayments for goods or services received in the destination country and can account for receipts from same-day visitors, except when they are significant enough to warrant separate classification. However, for some countries, receipts for passenger transport items may not be included. The data is presented in current U.S. dollars and draws from sources such as the World Tourism Organization's Yearbook of Tourism Statistics, Compendium of Tourism Statistics, and data files. ("CEIC Data, " n.d.)

**Celebrates World Tourism Day**

According to Salam Watandar (2023) On World Tourism Day, officials at the Ministry of Information and Culture in Afghanistan celebrated the occasion with a program at the Darul Aman Palace in Kabul. During the event, plans were discussed to enhance tourism infrastructure by constructing internationally standardized hotels in Ghor, Paktia, Kapisa, and Nuristan provinces. The deputy of publishing affairs highlighted that since the rule of the Islamic Emirate, the number of foreign tourists visiting different parts of the country has been increasing steadily, with 4,200 visitors from various countries recorded so far. Acting Minister of Information and Culture, emphasized the economic benefits of foreign tourists' visits, stating that they showcase the true face of Afghanistan and contribute to the country's economic growth. Sher Mohammad Abbas Stanekzai, the political deputy of the Ministry of Foreign Affairs, encouraged foreign tourists and citizens of neighboring countries to explore Afghanistan's historical sites, highlighting their unique appeal. Furthermore, the Ministry of Information and Culture revealed their collaboration with the Ministry of Agriculture, Irrigation, and Livestock on a plan to boost the tourism industry in Band Amir Dam, located in Bamyan province.
Positive Experiences and Increased Tourism in Afghanistan

According to Ariana News. (2023) the tourists visiting Afghanistan have shared positive experiences and expressed their enjoyment of the country. Some tourists praised traditional Afghan clothing, finding it comfortable in the hot weather. They expressed astonishment and admiration for the beauty of the country, confirming that it matched their expectations. The tourists mentioned visiting historical sites and immersing themselves in Afghan culture and customs. Additionally, officials in Balkh province reported an increase in the number of domestic and foreign visitors, with over 190 foreign tourists from 32 different countries visiting the province in the first three months of the year. Balkh is home to numerous ancient and historical sites, such as the tomb of Hazrat Ali and the Khanqah of Maulana Jalaluddin Mohammad Balkhi's father.

Growing Tourism in Afghanistan

According to (Afghan Voice Agency, 2021) Maulavi Mohammad Nabi Baha, the general director of Afghan Tour State Company, approximately 2,700 foreign tourists visited Afghanistan for tourism in 2021 and explored the country's historical sites. The tourism industry generated 67 million Afghanis in revenue during the past year. Baha highlighted that they have established a solid foundation for domestic and international tourism, which is unprecedented in the last four decades. Mullah Khairullah Khairkhah, the Acting Minister of Information and Culture, emphasized the importance of preserving and managing the native culture, historical sites, and natural resources of different regions to satisfy tourists and encourage them to revisit these areas. He also mentioned that developing the tourism industry requires effective management, comprehensive planning, and the utilization of available resources, a program that the currently implementing to attract tourists.

Reviving Afghanistan's Tourism Industry

According to (Financial Tribune, 2017) the efforts are being made to revive Afghanistan's tourism industry, which has been severely affected by decades of conflict. Despite travel advisories, the country's attractions are starting to gain attention. Band-e-Amir, the first national park in Afghanistan, with its stunning turquoise lakes in the Hindu Kush mountain range, is a top draw. Bamiyan, the province where the park is located, has become safer and more progressive, hosting events like the Bamiyan Marathon and promoting winter sports through the Afghan Ski Challenge. These efforts have resulted in a surge in tourism, primarily from local visitors. Tour operators are also organizing trips to Afghanistan, bringing in a modest number of international tourists. The industry is showing signs of growth, offering hope for the country's tourism potential.

Afghanistan, a country at the crossroads of civilizations, has long captivated the interest of the world. With a history shaped by influential figures
and a reputation for legendary hospitality, it offers a unique opportunity for travelers seeking adventure. Untamed Borders. (n.d.)

**METHODOLOGY**

This review paper employs a systematic approach to know the Evolution of Tourism in Afghanistan: A Review of the Last 50 Years. The methodology includes the following steps:

a. Comprehensive searches were conducted using electronic databases and search engine such as JSTOR, Scopus, and Google Scholar, Bing to identify relevant articles and news, related books, studies, and reports published on the topic. The search strategy involved using keywords and search terms including “tourism in Afghanistan," "tourism history in Afghanistan," "Afghanistan," and related terms. The time frame for the literature search was not limited. Additionally, a manual search was performed by reviewing the reference lists of relevant sources to ensure the inclusion of all relevant studies.

b. The initial search results were imported into reference management software, and duplicate articles were removed. The remaining articles were then screened based on their titles and abstracts. Studies that did not meet the inclusion criteria were excluded. The inclusion criteria for this review included a focus on the Evolution of Tourism in Afghanistan: A Review of the Last 50 Years, inclusion of case studies, reports or best practices, and publication.

c. The articles selected after the title and abstract screening underwent a full-text review. The full texts were carefully examined to determine their suitability for inclusion in the review. Any articles that did not meet the inclusion criteria or did not provide sufficient information for analysis were excluded. The final selection of articles, news, reports for analysis was based on their relevance, quality, and contribution to the research objectives.

d. The included articles were systematically analyzed to extract relevant data and information related to the Evolution of Tourism in Afghanistan: A Review of the Last 50 Years. Key findings, methodologies, reports, news, and best practices were extracted and synthesized to provide a comprehensive overview of the topic.

e. By following this methodology, a total of 40 articles and 22 case studies and reports were generated from the literature search. After the screening process, 17 articles and news reports were finally included for analysis in this review.
RESULT
The review reveals the profound impact of the political and security situation, the influence of factors on tourist arrivals such as heritage sites and geopolitical factors, the evolution of marketing strategies and promotion efforts, and the challenges and opportunities faced by Afghanistan's tourism industry, including political instability, security concerns, inadequate infrastructure, limited financing, and negative perceptions, with the potential for sustainable development through strengthened security measures, improved infrastructure, enhanced marketing efforts, and international partnerships.

DISCUSSION
The review of the evolution of tourism in Afghanistan over the past 50 years reveals significant changes, challenges, and opportunities that have shaped the country's tourism industry. This section presents the key findings and a discussion of the major themes and trends observed during this period.

1. Political and Security Impact: The political and security situation in Afghanistan has had a profound impact on the evolution of tourism. Decades of conflicts, including the Soviet invasion, civil war, and internal conflict, resulted in a decline in tourist arrivals and the deterioration of tourism infrastructure. The unstable political climate and security concerns continue to pose challenges for the growth of the tourism industry.

2. Factors Influencing Tourist Arrivals: Several factors have influenced the growth or decline of tourist arrivals in Afghanistan. The presence of heritage sites, such as the Buddhas of Bamian and Band-e-Amir lakes, has attracted international visitors interested in the country's rich cultural history. Additionally, geopolitical factors, such as international relations and travel advisories, have influenced tourists' perceptions and decisions to visit Afghanistan. Infrastructure development, accessibility, and visa policies have also played a role in shaping tourist arrivals.

3. Marketing Strategies and Promotion: The promotion and marketing of Afghanistan as a tourist destination have evolved over the last 50 years. In the early years, limited efforts were made to market Afghanistan to international tourists. However, in recent times, there has been an increase in marketing initiatives aimed at showcasing the country's cultural heritage, natural beauty, and adventure tourism opportunities. Social media and digital platforms have played a vital role in raising awareness about Afghanistan as a unique and off-the-beaten-path destination.

4. Challenges and Opportunities: Afghanistan faces numerous challenges in developing its tourism industry. Political instability, security concerns,
inadequate infrastructure, limited access to financing, and negative perceptions are some of the key obstacles. However, there are significant opportunities to tap into the potential of Afghanistan's tourism sector. The country's diverse cultural heritage, stunning landscapes, and untapped natural resources provide a solid foundation for sustainable tourism development. Strengthening security measures, improving infrastructure, enhancing marketing efforts, and fostering international partnerships can help overcome the challenges and unlock the tourism potential.

CONCLUSION / RECOMMENDATION

Conclusion
The review of the evolution of tourism in Afghanistan over the last 50 years highlights the complex interplay between political, security, and socio-economic factors in shaping the industry. Despite the challenges, there are clear opportunities for Afghanistan to develop a sustainable and thriving tourism sector. By addressing the barriers and leveraging the country's unique offerings, Afghanistan can attract more tourists, create employment opportunities, and contribute to its economic growth and cultural preservation. However, achieving these goals will require concerted efforts from government authorities, local communities, and relevant stakeholders to ensure a secure and welcoming environment for tourists.

Recommendation
Strengthen security measures to ensure the safety of tourists, including improving law enforcement and implementing effective strategies.

Preserve and promote Afghanistan's cultural heritage sites, such as the Buddhas of Bamian and Band-e-Amir lakes, through restoration efforts and international recognition.

Enhance digital marketing efforts through social media platforms to showcase Afghanistan's cultural heritage, natural beauty, and adventure tourism opportunities.

Collaborate with travel agencies and tour operators specializing in off-the-beaten-path destinations to attract a wider audience and build trust among potential visitors.

Improve infrastructure, including transportation networks, accommodation options, and tourist facilities, to enhance accessibility and visitor experiences.

Foster international partnerships with organizations, tourism boards, and investors to access funding, technical expertise, and knowledge sharing.
Involve local communities in tourism planning and development to ensure their active participation, preserve cultural authenticity, and create economic opportunities.

FURTHER STUDY
This research still has limitations, so further research needs to be carried out regarding the topic of Tourism Development in Improving the Community Economy. to perfect this research and increase insight for readers.

REFERENCES


