Surface Strategy Taxonomy in Errors Analysis: Made by the Students of Senior High School

Oktaviana M.F.Q. Bobe
STKIP Sinar Pancasila

Corresponding Author: Oktaviana M.F.Q. Bobe oktavianabobe@gmail.com

ARTICLE INFO
Keywords: Grammar, Translation, Surface Strategy Taxonomy

Received : 1 January
Revised : 13 February
Accepted : 17 March

©2024 Bobe: This is an open-access article distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Atribusi 4.0 Internasional.

ABSTRACT

This research was conducted to find out and analyze the grammatical errors in translating Indonesian procedure text into English. The aim of this research was to find out and analyze the errors and their types. This problem was categorized under grammatical errors using four types of Dullay’s Strategy Taxonomy, they are omission, addition, misformation, and misordering. The researcher used descriptive qualitative method. Generally, there are several techniques to collect data needed such as the researcher prepared two Indonesian procedure texts, then gave the texts to the students. The researcher used test technique to collect the data needed and the test was done for 60 minutes in class. The data were presented in the form of table and ordered based on each of the translation problems to make it easier for the analysis. The result of the data analysis reveals that the problems which occurred in the students’ worksheet are related to the types of grammatical errors (33,48 %) omission errors, (4,21 %) addition errors, (4,44%) misformation errors, (57,84%) misordering errors. The most identified error belongs to misordering error which is given the highest score to the total number of errors identified (57,84%) and the least identified one belongs to addition error category (4,21%). The fact indicates that there are some students who have adequate knowledge in translating the texts. In other words, there are also students who have problems in translating Indonesian procedure texts into English

DOI: https://doi.org/10.59890/ijir.v2i3.1509
E-ISSN: 2988-2184
https://journal.multitechpublisher.com/index.php/ijir
INTRODUCTION

Language is a means of communication. A human uses language to communicate with others. According to Halliday (1985), one of the language functions is to express our experience of the world around us. By communicating with the others in a language society, we can build bridges into other people as minds and thus we share our experiences. According to Hornby (1981, cited in Bustan, 2012:6), “Language is a systematic means of communicating ideas or feelings by the use of conventionalized signs, sounds, gestures or marks having understood meanings”. As has been mentioned from the definition above, Language is a system, and as a system language consists of three aspects, that is pronunciation, vocabulary, and grammar. Pronunciation deals with the way a word of language is pronounced; vocabulary deals with the total number of words in language and grammar refers to the rules of the language in constructing sentences.

English is an international language although it is not spoken by countries in the world. In learning English, learners are expected to know four language skills. Raimes (1983) states that when we learn a second language, we learn to communicate with other people; to understand them, to talk to them, read what they have written, and write to them. Raimes’s statement helps us to understand the four language skills they are listening, speaking, reading, and writing. Every language including English has its own grammar. According to Webster (1882) “Grammar is the study of the classes of words, their inflections, and their functions and relations in the sentence”. In relation to Wikipedia (2017), “English grammar is the way in which meanings are encoded into wordings in the English language”. This includes the structure of words, phrases, clauses, and sentences, right up to the structure of whole texts. From both definitions above, grammar is combining meaningful words structurally into good sentence.

Learning grammar is important. Many researchers stated their opinion about the importance of grammar. Saaristo (2015) argued that “Grammar is the key concept in general linguistic theory”. Furthermore, Hudson & Walmsley (2005) found that both teachers and students perceived grammar instruction as something necessary in learning language. Grammar is defined as a form of language, but more than form, Larsen-Freeman (2014) stated, it is what forms mean and when and why they are used. We cannot produce a correct way in communicating our thoughts without forming grammatically correct sentences. Hence, it can be concluded that grammar is an item in mastering a language that we cannot overlook because of its universal application in every aspect of language.

Nowadays, most English learners often make grammatical mistakes in learning it. We all know that the problems are not only dealing with speaking, listening, reading, and writing but also with grammar. As Azar (2007) in the study of Generation University students in the United States, found that the students had poor grammatical knowledge and had difficulties in their writing even though their speaking and listening skills were described as fluent. In order to be competent in translating text, the students must know the grammatical patterns of English. Dulay expresses that an error made by the learners because of the lack of grammar (1982 in Brown, 1994). Meanwhile, Abushihad (2014)
found that many learners at the University of Turkey made some errors in writing, especially in tenses, prepositions, and morphological errors.

Beaugrande (1996) says that learning about grammar is learning about rules. English grammar itself becomes as a body of rules specifying how meanings are created in English. There are many accounts of grammar which tend to fall into two parts: Firstly, descriptive grammars which describe the patterns, through which meanings are typically created, are functional speech and writing. Secondly, the perspective grammar which sets out preexisting rules to how meanings are created. In this section, the writer would like to say that grammar must be implicitly in a written language in order to compose an appropriate writing and make it easy to be understood. There are many difficulties encountered by the learners when they learn English at the first time. The difficulties are including how to translate Indonesian procedure text into English and how to form good text in English. It might be caused by unfamiliarity of English as a foreign language and the lack of grammar.

Nowadays, we have entered a global era where English is obviously been the very strong instrument to penetrate other nations’ boundaries by a massive communication wave. Grammar in translating has been great importance for the students when they learn English. However, the students sometimes make errors in translating Indonesian text into English, especially the grammar. That is why the researcher is interested in conducting the research to find out the Surface Strategy Taxonomy Error in Translating Indonesian Procedure Texts into English Made by the Students of Senior High School.

LITERATURE REVIEW

This research is meant to answer the following questions:

1. What are the types of error in translating Indonesian procedure texts into English made by the Students of Senior High School?

There are four types of error; they are Linguistic Category, Surface Strategy Taxonomy, Comparative Analysis, and Communicative Effect, Dullay in Tarigan (1992). In this research, the researcher analyzes the data based on surface strategy taxonomy. Surface strategy taxonomy highlights are the way surface structures are altered. It holds much promise to concern with identifying cognitive process and makes us aware of the learners’ errors based on some logic. It can be divided into four categories namely: Omission, Addition, Misformation, and Misordering.

Omission errors are characterized by the absence for an item that must appear in a well-formed utterance. For instance, in Indonesian sentence “Saya suka bernyanyi lagu pop”, if this sentence possibility that the learners will translate it as “I like sing a pop song”, however the appropriate translation for the sentence is “I like singing a pop song”. From the sentence, we can see that there is an item which gets omitted in that sentence that is “ing”. “Ing” is actually a morpheme. It can stand as an inflectional morpheme or derivational morpheme. However, in this case, “ing” functions as a derivational morpheme which changes the word-class of the word “eat” which is originally a verb into a gerund which functions as a noun. In constructing a proper sentence, there are rules that we have to follow and they cannot be neglected. If someone fails in
constructing a proper sentence by omitting an item that must exist in the sentence then the error is called omission error.

Addition errors are the opposite of omission. They are characterized by the presence of an item, which must not appear in a well-formed utterance, as in; He did not gave the book last night, he give me a letter. From those examples above, we can see the errors committed. The first example deals with the use of auxiliary verb in the sentence functioning as a replacement to take the tense marker in the negative sentence. And it is also known that if the auxiliary verb has got the tense marker, then the main verb (in this case, a past sentence) must go back to the V1 not V2 anymore. Meanwhile the second example deals with the verb agreement. People understanding English well know that the third singular person (she, he, and it), they have a special treatment in present form. If the third singular person stands as subject in present tense sentence then the verb which stands as predicate must be added “s/es” at the end of the verb. But in the second example, the student did not add morpheme “s” at the end of verb “give” which wrong grammatically. So the well-formed sentence is “He gives me a letter”.

Misformation errors are characterized by the use of the wrong form of elements in a phrase or sentence. In misformation errors the learners supply something. Meanwhile in addition errors, the item are not supplied at all, in misformation errors; the learner supplies something, although it is incorrect’, as in; “she have short hair”. The change of the word “have” is not supplied by the learner. The well-formed sentence is “she has short hair” (Perempuan itu mempunyai rambut yang pendek).

Misordering errors are characterized by the incorrect placement of a morpheme or group of morphemes in an utterance. Specifically, “He is all the time late”. Because the interference of their first language the learners may not put the word or the group of words in the right place. So they may make misordering errors. The sentence must be “He is late all the time”.

**METHODOLOGY**

This study was categorized as a descriptive research because it naturally describes the existing phenomena without intervention or experimental manipulation (Haan, 2004). According to Bodgan et al., (in Sugiyono, 2013: 15), descriptive qualitative data is collected in the form of words of pictures rather than number. Furthermore, Snape et al (in Ritchie et al., 2003: 2) implies that descriptive qualitative research deals with conducting descriptively naturalistic inquiry in real-world rather than experimental or manipulated settings (though methods vary in the extent to which they capture naturally occurring or generated data. Qualitative research describes naturally the existing phenomena without intervention or experimental manipulation (Haan, 2004:4). In this research, the writer used descriptive qualitative method to analyze students’ translation in translating Indonesian procedure texts into English made by eleventh grade students of SMA N 9 Kupang. The research was done according to the following steps, they are collection of sample data, identification the errors, classification into error types, evaluation of errors. The population of this research is the whole students of five classes of the eleventh grade students of SMA Negeri 9 Kupang. As (Polit et al., 1999: 37) say that population refers to the totality of all the objects, subjects, or members that conform to a set of
specifications. In contrast to population that involves the whole subjects, the sample neither concerns with all of the research subjects. According to Polit et al. (1999: 227), sample is a subset of a population selected to participate in the study, it is a fraction of the whole. In this research, sample is taken between 10-15% and 20-25% of the population, but if the population is less than 100, the whole number of the population will be taken as sample. Dealing with this, the sample of this research was from all students of XI IPA 1 of the Eleventh Grade students of SMA N 9 Kupang because the number of students in the class was 26 students.

The research instruments used in this research were Indonesian procedures texts taken from (www.ResepIndonesia.http://id.wikipedia.org/wiki/Resep-Indonesia) and answer sheets. Generally, there are several techniques to collect data needed such as the researcher prepared two Indonesian procedure texts. Then, the researcher gave the texts to the students. The researcher used test technique to collect the data needed. The test was done for 60 minutes in class. In analyzing the data, the researcher checked students’ worksheet, identified the grammatical errors, grouping the grammatical errors’ types based on surface taxonomy strategy, finally the researcher corrected and Evaluating the Errors.

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

The result of the research shows that most of the students have made errors in translating Indonesian procedure text into English. The errors happened in four types of Dullay’s surface strategy taxonomy, they are omission, addition, misformation, and misordering.

Omission

Omission error is characterized by the absence of an item that must appear in a well-formed utterance.

The omission errors which were made by the students are presented in the list below:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No</th>
<th>Indonesian</th>
<th>English (Incorrect Translations)</th>
<th>The correction</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Minyak sayur, 3 sendok makan</td>
<td>Vegetable oil, 3 tablespoon</td>
<td>3 tablespoons of vegetable oil</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Cabe merah, 2 biji</td>
<td>2 red pepper</td>
<td>2 pieces of red pepper</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

From the table above, we can see that there are two examples of omission errors presented in the students’ translation. And below are the explanations of each error.

Error no.1 deals with the omission of “s/es” in the word “tablespoons” to indicate plural form. This kind of errors is mostly found in students’ translation. But the researcher only chose one of them as the representation of the error. From the example no. 1, the correct translation should be 3 tablespoons not 3 tablespoon, because there is a determiner of countable noun that is 3. So, the bound morpheme “s” must be added to the noun.
Error no.2 deals with omission of noun determiner “2 pieces” to indicate that the noun is countable. Because the students said that “2 red pepper”, so the correct translation should be “2 pieces of red pepper”.

**Addition Error**

Addition error is the opposite of omission. They are characterized by the presence of an item, which must not appear in a well-formed utterance.

The addition errors which were made by the students are presented in the list below

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 2. Examples of Addition Errors</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The examples in the table above are the representatives of the addition errors for each group of errors presented. Each of examples above will be explained by the researcher below.

Error no.1 deals with appearance of bound morpheme “s/es” to indicate plural. In the example no.1, the students added “s” at the end of the word “kilograms”, but the correct translation is “1 kilo of meat”, because the noun determiner is “1”, so the noun is singular.

Error no.2 deals with appearance of “ing” at the end of verb. The addition is not necessary because in procedure text, the tenses used is simple present tense and the verb does not to be added with “ing” to make it gerund because it is not used as sentence subject.

Error no.3 deals with appearance of suffix “ly” at the end of the word. Here the students added an unnecessary suffix which is “ly”.

**Misformation Error**

Misformation error is characterized by the use of the wrong form of elements in a phrase or sentence. In misformation errors the learners used wrong language structure.

And below there is the example of misformation error:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 3. Examples of Misformation Errors</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The table above shows us the representative of the misformation errors. And here is the explanation of the error presented.

Error no.1 deals with the use of incorrect verb. In the sentence no. 1, the students made error with the tenses. They used Verb II in the verb “used”,
meanwhile the correct tense used in procedure text is simple present tense. So the correct translation should be “use your fingers”.

Misordering Error
Misordering error is characterized by the incorrect placement of a morpheme or group of morphemes in a utterance. There are the examples of misordering errors which were committed in students’ translation:

Table 4. Examples of Misordering Errors

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No</th>
<th>Indonesian</th>
<th>English (Incorrect Translations)</th>
<th>The correction</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>Langkah kedua</td>
<td>Step two</td>
<td>Second step</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>Cara membuat nasi goreng iga sapi</td>
<td>How to make fried rice beef ribs</td>
<td>How to make beef ribs fried rice</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.</td>
<td>Panaskan minyak sayur</td>
<td>Heat oil vegetable</td>
<td>Heat the vegetable oil</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The examples provided above describe that the students are not having adequate knowledge about English sentence patterns when they want to compose a proper sentence. And below are the explanations why those errors above are characterized as the misordering error.

Error no.1 deals with the use of Ordinal number. In constructing English procedure text the writer usually uses ordinal number to indicate the steps. In the translation sentence no.1, the students used wrong number which was Cardinal number. And the correct translation is “second step” because the ordinal number “second” is used to indicate the steps.

Error no.2 deals with the error of misordering English noun phrase. in the second translation, the students translate the noun phrase by following Indonesian word order. The students translated the sentence “nasi goreng iga sapi” as “fried rice beef ribs”, but the correct translation is “beef ribs fried rice”.

Error no.3 deals with the incorrect placement of modified and modifier. In the translation no.3, the students translate the sentence “minyak sayur” as “oil vegetable. The translation is incorrect because in English, the modified precedes the modifier while in Indonesian the modified comes after the modifier. So, the correct translation is “food oil”.

Table 5. Total Number of Grammatical Errors Committed

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No</th>
<th>Students</th>
<th>Error</th>
<th>Total</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>O</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>MF</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>AA</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>AB</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.</td>
<td>AC</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.</td>
<td>AD</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.</td>
<td>AE</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.</td>
<td>AF</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.</td>
<td>AG</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.</td>
<td>AH</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Based on the table provided above, we can see the total errors of surface strategy taxonomy in students' translation of SMA Negeri 9 Kupang. The result of the data analysis reveals that the problems which occurred in the students' worksheet are related to the types of grammatical errors (33.48%) omission errors, (4.21%) addition errors, (4.44%) misformations errors, (57.84%) misordering errors. The most identified errors belongs to misordering errors which is given the highest score to the total number of errors identified (57.84%) and the least identified one belongs to addition error category (4.21%). The most errors found in students' translation are misordering errors that is 247 errors or 57.84% of the total percentage and the least error belongs to addition error which was 18 errors or 4.21% of the total percentage. The table is made based on the number given by the researcher on students' worksheets. Based on the table, we can see that the student AI has the least number of errors in her translation with 1 error or 0.23% of the total percentage, meanwhile the student AC has the highest number of errors in his translation with 25 errors or 5.85% of the total percentage.

The table explains that misordering error is the highest number to the total number. This error would be the most problematic areas that the students or even teachers have to really pay attention to in order to improve a better understanding of English as their target language when it comes to translate the procedure texts.
In addition to that, the students have to put the word or the group of words in the right place. For example, in Indonesian sentence “panaskan minyak sayur” they translated as “heat oil vegetable”. In this sentence the students misplaced the words. Because the correct translation sentence must be “heat the food oil”. The students do not have sufficient knowledge about English that is why the quality of translations is not really good. It can be said that the students are still weak at translating.

In addition to the finding, there were 26 students’ worksheets. And most of them have misordering errors. It can be concluded that they are still influenced by their source language word order.

CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

The findings found by the researcher showed that the grammatical errors in the students’ translations of SMA Negeri 9 Kupang are divided into the error classifications based on Dullay’s surface strategy taxonomy. The errors include omission, addition, misformation and misordering. The total number of errors committed in their translation is 427 errors. The most identified error belongs to misordering error which is given the highest score to the total number of errors identified and the least identified one belongs to addition error category.

The errors were found because the students lacked of the knowledge of target language. This made them difficult to translate the texts because they did not have adequate knowledge about the rules of the target language especially in forming English procedure texts. They tend to use their structure of source language when they translate the texts and it can be seen from the word orders which are similar with the Indonesian word orders which are their source language (word-for-word translation). So it can be concluded that the students still influenced by their source language word order.

FURTHER STUDY

This research deals with the investigation of grammatical errors produced by EFL students of Senior High School and how students learn English Grammar. This research exposed the kinds of students’ grammatical errors in their writing so that it can help learners overcome the problem and achieve the aims in learning English.

This research has similarities with some previous related studies. The researcher analyzed the students’ grammatical error in writing. This supported by the data that some researcher have done which related to this research. Hermini (2015) stated that the major causes of their errors were ignorance of the rule structure and interference. There were few differences between both groups in committing errors. Both groups had a difference in frequency of committing such as part of speech, irregular verbs, infinitive verb and other errors in verb (developmental errors). It could be caused by the difficulty level of the target language grammar as Indonesian and English have differences in syntactic features and interference. There was a similarity between Hermin’s research and this research that both of researchers analyzed the students’ grammatical errors in writing. The difference of Hermin’s research and this research was the kind of
text. Hermini’s research used analyzed students’ grammatical errors in recount text while the researcher analyzed in procedure text.

Sukasame et al (2013) found that past perfect tense was the most committed errors that occur in the work of the students. The second most error was past simple tense and the third was present perfect tense, while past continuous tense was the fourth position and the fifth error was present simple tense, and follow up future simple tense. The last one was presenting continuous. There was a similarity between Sukasame’s research and this research that both of researchers wanted to analyze students’ grammatical errors in writing. The difference of his research and this research was the scope of research. Sukasame’s research focused on grammatical structure of tenses while this research focused on grammatical errors based on surface strategy taxonomy.

The distinction of previous studies and the researcher study were the purposes of the research. The students’ errors can inform the teachers to provide the feedback, reflect on what should be improved, and decided the new approach in teaching English. In this research, the researcher wanted to know the factors influence student in learning English grammar. Based on previous studies, the researcher expected to fulfill the gap or the deficiency of previous studies in order to improve the research relates to grammatical error on writing procedure text. Then, Nunan (1995); Sutikno and Fathurrohman (2007) adds that the students’ achievement are influenced by many factors such as media, learning material, assessment, input, media, learning resources, and learning method. And it will take any consideration for the researcher about what factors influence students in learning English grammar.

REFERENCES


Hermini. 2015. Grammatical Error Analysis in Recount Texts Made by The Students of Cokroaminoto University Of Palopo. Post Graduate Program State University of Makassar.


